

# An almost magic proposition about infinite subsets of $\mathbb{R}$

The proposition below is an implication of the form:  $P \Rightarrow Q \vee R$ . This implication is equivalent to the implication  $P \wedge \neg Q \Rightarrow R$ . One way to see this is to consider the negations of these implications. The negation of  $P \Rightarrow Q \vee R$  is  $P \wedge (\neg Q \wedge \neg R)$ , while the negation of  $P \wedge \neg Q \Rightarrow R$  is  $(P \wedge \neg Q) \wedge \neg R$ . Since the negations are clearly equivalent, the implications are also equivalent.

**Proposition.** *Let  $A \subset \mathbb{R}$ . If  $A$  is infinite, then there exists a nonempty subset  $B$  of  $A$  such that  $B$  does not have a minimum or there exists a nonempty subset  $C$  of  $A$  such that  $C$  does not have a maximum.*

*Proof.* We will prove the equivalent implication: If  $A$  is an infinite subset of  $\mathbb{R}$  and each nonempty subset of  $A$  has a minimum, then there exist a nonempty subset  $C$  of  $A$  such that  $C$  does not have a maximum.

So, assume that  $A$  is an infinite subset of  $\mathbb{R}$  and each nonempty subset of  $A$  has a minimum. Then, in particular,  $\min A$  exists. Let  $W$  be the set of all minimums of infinite subsets of  $A$ . Formally,

$$W = \left\{ x \in A : x = \min E \text{ where } E \subset A \text{ and } E \text{ is infinite} \right\}.$$

Clearly  $\min A$  is an element in  $W$ . Hence  $W \neq \emptyset$ .

Next we will prove that  $W$  does not have a maximum. Let  $y \in W$  be arbitrary. Then there exists an infinite subset  $F$  of  $A$  such that  $y = \min F$ . Since  $F$  is infinite, the set  $F \setminus \{y\}$  is also infinite. Since  $F \setminus \{y\} \subset A$ , by the assumption  $z = \min(F \setminus \{y\})$  exists. Therefore,  $z \in W$ . Since  $z \in F \setminus \{y\}$ , we have  $z \neq y$ . Since  $z \in F$  and  $y = \min F$ , we have  $z \geq y$ . Hence  $z > y$ . Thus, for each  $y \in W$  there exists  $z \in W$  such that  $z > y$ . This proves that  $W$  is a nonempty subset of  $A$  which does not have a maximum.  $\square$